

Application No: [W 18 / 0676](#)

Town/Parish Council: Stoneleigh
Case Officer: Emma Spandley
01926 456553 emma.spandley@warwickdc.gov.uk

Registration Date: 17/05/18
Expiry Date: 12/07/18

North Lodge, Coventry Road, Stoneleigh, Coventry, CV8 3DT
Demolition of existing outbuilding and erection of a replacement detached outbuilding. FOR Mr & Mrs Crofts

This application is being presented to Committee as the Parish Council supports the application and it is recommended for refusal.

RECOMMENDATION

The application is recommended for refusal for the reasons listed below.

DETAILS OF THE DEVELOPMENT

The application proposes the demolition of an existing garage / store and the erection of replacement detached building.

THE SITE AND ITS LOCATION

North Lodge is a mid 19th Century ashlar cottage in neo-Tudor design. It has a steeply pitched plain tile roof with four gabled ends and wide eaves and bargeboards and is Grade II Listed. It is located within the grounds of the listed Stoneleigh Deer Park.

PLANNING HISTORY

W/15/1006/LB - Proposed rebuilding of the rear bay window, building up off the existing stone base, with stone mullions and transoms, a slated roof and timber windows to infill. Replacement of the existing brown windows with white painted single glazed timber windows, with diamond pattern lead. In addition secondary glazing within a matching frame internally - Granted 17th August 2015.

W/11/1409 & 1410/LB - Removal of existing oil tank and replace with LPG storage tank, granted 29th Feb 2012.

W/97/1001 & 1002/LB - Erection of a detached building to provide garaging, with workshop over (after demolition of existing garage); erection of a conservatory and utility room including increase in roof height of outbuildings and re-roofing; construction of garden wall to provide garden enclosure, granted 5th November 1997.

RELEVANT POLICIES

- National Planning Policy Framework

- DS5 - Presumption in Favour of Sustainable Development (Warwick District Local Plan 2011-2029)
- DS18 - Green Belt (Warwick District Local Plan 2011-2029)
- HE1 - Protection of Statutory Heritage Assets (Warwick District Local Plan 2011-2029)
- BE1 - Layout and Design (Warwick District Local Plan 2011-2029)
- BE3 - Amenity (Warwick District Local Plan 2011-2029)
- TR3 - Parking (Warwick District Local Plan - 2011-2029)

SUMMARY OF REPRESENTATIONS

Stoneleigh and Ashow Parish Council: Support

Historic England: No objection

Ecology (WCC): No objection

Highways (WCC): No objection

ASSESSMENT

The main issues relevant to the consideration of this application are:-

- Whether the proposal constitutes appropriate development in the Green Belt and if not, whether any very special circumstances exist to outweigh the harm by reason of inappropriateness.
- Impact on the Listed Building, Conservation Area and Registered Park and Garden.
- Impact on neighbours.

Whether the proposal constitutes appropriate development in the Green Belt and, if not, whether there are any very special circumstances which outweigh the harm by reason of inappropriateness and any other harm identified

The application property is located within the Green Belt. The National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) states that the essential characteristics of Green Belt are openness and permanence. The NPPF states, inappropriate development in the Green Belt is, by definition, harmful to the Green Belt and should not be approved except in very special circumstances. (Para 87.)

Paragraph 89 of the NPPF states the construction of new buildings within the Green Belt are inappropriate. However, there are a few exceptions, including, extensions to existing buildings & replacement buildings, which are not materially larger than those they replace.

The application seeks to replace two existing single storey, low profile, wooden, dilapidated garages, which are located to the south side of the property adjacent to the entrance to Stoneleigh Park beyond.

The existing buildings have a floor area of 59m², with a volume of 119.97m³.

The proposed building has a floor area of 64.20m², with a volume of 192.60m³.

The floor area of the proposed building is a 9% increase in the floor area of the existing building, whilst the volume of the proposed building in its entirety, is a 60% increase of the existing building.

To put it into context, whilst the floor area of the existing and proposed building is not materially larger, the roof structure of the existing building has a volume of just 8m³, compared to the proposed building having a roof volume of 51.36m³.

On this basis, looking at the building as a whole and taking into account not just the floor area calculations but also the volume calculations, the proposed building is considered to be materially larger than the one it replaces and therefore, fails the exception test set out within paragraph 89 & 90 of the NPPF.

Very Special Circumstances

As noted above, the proposed replacement garage building is materially larger than the building it replaces and therefore is considered to be inappropriate development within the Green Belt. The NPPF states, inappropriate development in the Green Belt is, by definition, harmful to the Green Belt and should not be approved except in very special circumstances.

The agent has indicated that due to the siting of the proposed building within the grounds of not only a grade II listed lodge, but also within a registered park and garden the design of the roof, which is where the majority of the additional bulk and massing is contained, responds to the prominent setting and has been carefully designed to harmonise with the main Grade II listed house.

The circumstances that the agent has put forward with regards to the setting of the garage building and the impact on the Listed Building are noted, but are not considered to amount to very special circumstances. The footprint of the building could, for example, be reduced in order to comply with the Green Belt policy and the design of the building remain acceptable in relation to the Listed Building and the adjacent registered park and gardens.

Design and Impact on the Listed Building & Registered Park and Garden

Section 72 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 imposes a duty when exercising planning functions to pay special attention to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character of a conservation area. Section 66 of the same Act imposes a duty to have special regard to the desirability of preserving a listed building or its setting when considering whether to grant a planning permission which affects a listed building or its setting.

Paragraph 132 of the NPPF states that when considering the impact of a proposed development on the significance of a designated heritage asset, great weight should be given to the asset's conservation. Paragraph 134 of the NPPF states that where a development proposal will lead to less than substantial harm to the significance of a designated heritage assets, the harm should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal, including securing its optimum viable use.

The proposed garage will have a similar footprint to the existing garages, but will have an eaves height of 2.2 metres with a ridge height of 4.5 metres. The building is a simple double garage structure which sits well with the existing building on site. The proposed building will also be constructed from brick and tile roof.

No objection in principle is raised by the Conservation Officer to a replacement garage structure on the site, which is located in the vicinity of the Grade II Listed North Lodge, as the existing modern structure is poorly built and in a state of disrepair. The materials for rainwater goods (metal), windows (timber and single glazed) and roofing (plain tiles) are both well considered and sympathetic with the setting of the Listed building. Furthermore, Historic England has raised no objections.

The proposed works are considered to have a neutral impact on the setting of the Grade II Listed Building and the adjacent park and garden and are considered to be in accordance with Policy HE2 of the Local Plan.

Impact on neighbours

There are no immediate neighbours who would be impacted by the proposed garage.

Summary

The property, the subject of the application, is within the Green Belt and the proposed replacement garage is considered to comprise inappropriate development to which there is an objection in principle in respect of which, no very special circumstances have been demonstrated.

REFUSAL REASONS

- 1 The property, subject of the application, is within the Green Belt, wherein the Planning Authority is concerned to ensure that the rural character of the area will be retained and protected in accordance with Local Plan Policy DS18 and national policy guidance contained in the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF). The NPPF states that the replacement of existing buildings in green belt areas may be appropriate provided the new building is not materially larger than the one it replaces.

The proposed garage would be materially larger than the garage that is to be replaced. Therefore the proposals constitute inappropriate development within the Green Belt. By reason of the increased size, the proposed garage would reduce the openness of the Green Belt. No very special circumstances exist to outweigh the conflict with Green Belt policy and the harm to the openness of the Green Belt.

The proposals are thereby considered to be contrary to the aforementioned policies.