Planning Committee: 27 February 2018 Item Number: 8

Application No: W 17 / 2146 LB

Registration Date: 14/11/17

Town/Parish Council: Ashow Expiry Date: 09/01/18

Case Officer: Dan Charles

01926 456527 dan.charles@warwickdc.gov.uk

Abbey Farm, Ashow Road, Ashow, Kenilworth, CV8 2LE

Conversion and extension of the existing garage/outbuilding and linking to the existing annexe building to create a new separate dwelling. FOR Mr & Mrs Burdett

This application has been requested to be presented to Committee by Councillor Wright and 5 letters of support have been received.

RECOMMENDATION

That Listed Building Consent is **REFUSED** for the reasons set out at the end of this report.

DETAILS OF THE DEVELOPMENT

The proposed development is to create a separate dwelling by providing a link from an existing Listed outbuilding to connect it to an existing garage building which will be converted to accommodation.

The alterations to the Curtilage Listed Outbuilding itself comprise the provision of the link, a new external window to the rear to serve a bedroom and the addition of internal partitions to create a hallway and an en-suite bathroom.

The garage building would have the frontage infilled to create additional living accommodation. The external materials proposed would be timber cladding and plain clay tiles to match the existing building.

The site would then be sub-divided from the main Abbey Farm dwelling and garden with its own curtilage.

THE SITE AND ITS LOCATION

The site forms part of the main dwelling known as Abbey Farm, a Grade II Listed Building within the Ashow Conservation Area and located within the West Midlands Green Belt.

The proposal relates to the extension of an existing Listed outbuilding to the side of the main dwelling currently used as an annex. This annex building is single

storey and attached the neighbouring dwelling that forms part of the original conversion and is in separate ownership.

To the rear of the annexe outbuilding is a large, open car port/garage building containing 3 bays and set back from the rear of the existing annex where it sits adjacent to the rear of the neighbouring attached property.

The garage building is not a Curtilage Listed Building as it was constructed after the date of the Listing of the property.

To the rear is the garden area serving Abbey Farm that rises from the level of the buildings.

The site of the garage is set below the level of the land to the side and rear and the garage is set within substantial retaining walls.

PLANNING HISTORY

W/17/0960 & W/17/0961/LB - Erection of a single storey extension to an existing annex to form a new dwellinghouse (Use Class C3) – Withdrawn 03.08.2017.

RELEVANT POLICIES

- National Planning Policy Framework
- HE1 Protection of Statutory Heritage Assets (Warwick District Local Plan 2011-2029)

SUMMARY OF REPRESENTATIONS

Stoneleigh and Ashow Parish Council: No observations.

Ward Member Trevor Wright: Support the scheme as there are no reasons to object.

Conservation Advisory Forum: The proposed alterations and extensions to the Listed Farmhouse and the later garage buildings are considered to be poorly designed, over large, and by more than doubling the domestic living area have a suburbanising effect upon the appearance of the curtilage listed buildings. The proposed alterations and extensions will have a harmful impact on the setting of the heritage assets and to the appearance of the Ashow Conservation Area.

Public Response: 11 Letters of objection and 2 letters of support received. Matters raised relate specifically to the associated planning application and no specific Listed Building Consent matters were raised.

ASSESSMENT

The main issues relevant to the consideration of this application are as follows:

• the principle of development

• the impact on heritage assets

The Principle of the Development

Policy HE1 of the Local Plan expects development proposals to have appropriate regard to the significance of designated heritage assets. Where development would lead to substantial harm or the total loss of such a designated heritage asset, the policy sets out the requirements that will need to be satisfied to demonstrate that such harm is necessary to achieve substantial public benefits that outweigh the harm or loss. Where development would lead to less than substantial harm, such harm will be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal.

The impact on heritage assets

Section 66 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 imposes a duty to have special regard to the desirability of preserving a listed building or its setting when considering whether to grant a planning permission which affects a listed building or its setting.

Paragraph 132 of the NPPF states that when considering the impact of a proposed development on the significance of a designated heritage asset, great weight should be given to the asset's conservation.

Warwick District Local Plan Policy HE1 (protection of statutory heritage assets) states that permission will not be granted to alter or extend a listed building where those works will adversely affect its special architectural or historic interest, integrity, or setting.

In making the assessment, it is noted that the existing outbuilding/annex is considered to be a Curtilage Listed Building whereas the existing garage building is not.

It is considered that the proposed extension; the linking of 2 outbuildings to form a single dwelling along with the proposed installation of windows, doors, rooflights, and rainwater goods etc would result in an extensive single building and reflect an increasingly domestic style which represents an increasing diversion from the Listed outbuilding's original more simple appearance and character which would materially impact upon its character and appearance to an unacceptable degree. By virtue of the relationship of that altered and extended building to Abbey Farm House which is the primary Listed Building within the site, and which is located to the east at a distance of some 8 metres, it is considered that the proposals would also unacceptably impact upon the setting of that Listed Building.

The proposals are therefore considered to result in less than substantial harm to the character and setting of the Listed Buildings within the site which is to be weighed against any public benefits of the proposal, including securing its optimum viable use. In this case, it is considered that the harm to the Curtilage Listed outbuilding and the setting of the Grade II Listed Farmhouse outweigh any public benefits which would arise from the proposals.

SUMMARY/CONCLUSION

For the above reasons, the proposed development is considered harmful to the setting of the Grade II Listed Building and the Curtilage Listed Building at the site and therefore, the principle of the proposed works is considered to be contrary to the provisions of Policy HE1 of the Local Plan together with National Guidance contained within the NPPF and the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990

It is therefore recommended that Listed Building Consent is refused.

REFUSAL REASONS

The works proposed will have negative impact on the character and setting of the Listed building and are considered to result in less than substantial harm to the building. No public benefits outweigh the identified harm and therefore the proposal is therefore contrary to Policy HE1 of the Warwick District Local Plan 2011-2029, guidance within the NPPF and Section 66 of the Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.
