

Planning Committee: 20 September 2006

Item Number: 17

Application No: W 06 / 1142

Registration Date: 11/07/06

Town/Parish Council: Leamington Spa

Expiry Date: 05/09/06

Case Officer: Joanne Fitzsimons

01926 456534 planning_east@warwickdc.gov.uk

York Corner, 21 Adelaide Road, Leamington Spa, CV31 3PN

Alterations to existing garages and adjoining structure to provide second garage
FOR Table Top Properties Ltd

This application has been requested to be presented to Committee by Councillor Begg if the officer is minded to refuse and a request by Cllr Gifford if the officer is minded to grant.

SUMMARY OF REPRESENTATIONS

Town Council: No objection.

Neighbours: One neighbour has drawn attention to the lengthy planning history of this development; detrimental to the Conservation Area and the residential character of this area.

CAAF: Concern expressed at scale of this building and its impact on Conservation Area. This is an area of residential properties and should only have a residential scale of garaging.

RELEVANT POLICIES

- (DW) ENV3 - Development Principles (Warwick District Local Plan 1995)
- DP1 - Layout and Design (Warwick District Local Plan 1996 - 2011 Revised Deposit Version)
- DP2 - Amenity (Warwick District Local Plan 1996 - 2011 Revised Deposit Version).
- (DW) ENV6 - Protection and Enhancement of Conservation Areas (Warwick District Local Plan 1995)
- (DW) ENV8 - New Development within Conservation Areas (Warwick District Local Plan 1995)
- (DW) ENV18 - Historic Parks and Gardens (Warwick District Local Plan 1995)
- DAP10 - Protection of Conservation Areas (Warwick District 1996 - 2011 Revised Deposit Version)
- DAP11 - Unlisted Buildings in Conservation Areas (Warwick District 1996 - 2011 Revised Deposit Version)

- DAP13 - Protecting Historic Parks and Gardens (Warwick District 1996 - 2011 Revised Deposit Version)

PLANNING HISTORY

Relevant planning history pertaining to this site relates to the following: W04/0815 for the retention of a single storey garage extension to the garage at the rear. This was refused permission in June 2004 on the following grounds: *"...The single storey extension to the garage fails to comply with approved policies ... by reason of its height and its design...adversely affects the historic integrity, character and setting of the Conservation Area."* The garage extension was built without the benefit of planning consent.

W04/2300 for the retention of the single storey garage extension, together with amendments to the roof and door. This was refused permission on grounds cited above, and was taken to appeal. This was dismissed on the following grounds:

"The original {existing} is of a domestic scale, is not unduly prominent in the streetscene and does not have a serious consequence for the character and appearance of the area. The appeal relates to an extension to the original garage...the additional height and the increased size of the door opening mean that the extension stands out as a prominent and inappropriate feature in the context of the streetscene. The increased bulk of the garage is seen not only from York Road but also from the garden opposite. I consider that with its incongruous appearance the proposal has a damaging effect on the character and appearance of this part of the Conservation Area... As a result the extended garage would stand out as an incongruous curtilage building in the context of the Edwardian houses and it would be seen as a damaging and inappropriate feature within the streetscene.

KEY ISSUES

The Site and its Location

The application site relates to a detached property on the corner of Adelaide Road and York Road within the designated Conservation Area. The site has a single storey garage together with another garage built without consent (W04/0815) fronting onto York Road, opposite the historic park and gardens in the District designated in the English Heritage Register and the Warwick District Local Register.

Details of the Development

The proposal seeks to alter the existing, unauthorised garage to construct a pitched roof across the original garage in a form which would result in a half-hip roof.

Assessment

In light of the recent (2005) Inspector's decision in relation to the 2004 appeal. I am of the opinion that the proposed amendments to the design and appearance of this unauthorised development would not overcome the objections raised by either the District Council or the Inspector in the appeal decision and the development by reason of its siting, scale and design would be an unacceptable feature, detrimental to the character and appearance of the streetscene.

RECOMMENDATION

REFUSE for the reason listed below.

REFUSAL REASONS

- 1 Policy (DW) ENV3 of Warwick District Local Plan 1995 requires all development proposals to achieve a high standard of design, having regard to local styles, materials, the character of the surrounding area and of adjacent buildings, whilst Policy (DW) ENV6 of Warwick District Local Plan 1995 states that Conservation Areas in the District will be protected from development which would have a detrimental effect upon their character or appearance. In addition, Policy (DW) ENV8 requires that within Conservation Areas, development proposals will be required to achieve a high standard of design appropriate to the historic and special architectural character of the area. These are reflected in Policies DP1 of the emerging Warwick District Local Plan 1996-20011 (first deposit version) which requires all development proposals to make a positive contribution to the character and the quality of its environment through good layout and design and DP2 which states that development will not be permitted which has an unacceptable adverse impact on the amenity of nearby uses and residents and/or does not provide acceptable standards of amenity for future users/occupiers of the development. Policy DAP11 of the emerging Warwick District Local Plan 1996-2011 also states that development will not be permitted to alter or extend unlisted buildings which would adversely affect the historic integrity, character or setting of the Conservation Area and Policy DAP 10 requires that development proposals to protect and enhance the historic quality, character and appearance of Conservation Areas.

Furthermore, Policy (DW) ENV18 of the Warwick District Local Plan 1995 states that development will not be permitted which would adversely affect the character, appearance amenity or enjoyment or setting of any of the historic park and gardens in the District designated in the English Heritage Register or the Warwick District Local Register. This is reflected in Policy

DAP13 of the emerging Warwick District Local Plan 1996-2011 which states development will not be permitted if it would harm the historic structure, character, principal components and setting of Parks and Gardens of Special Historic Interest designated in the English Heritage Register.

The application site is a detached garage to the rear of a large Edwardian dwelling house, which is located on the corner of Adelaide Road and York Road. The site also faces onto the historic gardens associated with York Walk, which forms part of the series of linked historic parks and gardens which has been designated in the English Heritage Register.

In the opinion of the District Planning Authority, proposal fails to comply with the requirements of the aforementioned policies by reason of its excessive height and scale and its design which is not considered to relate well to the fine Edwardian Building, the curtilage within which it is situated. It is considered that the garage occupies a prominent position within the street scene and adversely affects the historic integrity, character and setting of the Conservation Area. Furthermore, it is considered that the prominence of the site within the street scene and its close proximity to the historic gardens associated with York Walk adversely affects the setting of the adjoining historic park and gardens.

After careful consideration, taking into account the proposed changes to the scheme as already built, i.e. the introduction of a pitched roof with a gable feature and half hips and vertical boarded timber doors, it is considered that these changes would not mitigate the harm to the Conservation Area and the adjoining park and gardens outlined above.

The development would thereby be contrary to the objectives of the aforementioned policies.
