

Planning Committee: 09 October 2018

Item Number: 11

Application No: W 18 / 1520

Registration Date: 09/08/18

Town/Parish Council: Beausale, Haseley, Honiley & Wroxall

Expiry Date: 04/10/18

Case Officer: Emma Booker
01926 456521 Emma.Booker@warwickdc.gov.uk

Falcon Barn, Birmingham Road, Haseley, Warwick, CV35 7HA

Erection of single storey link extension between the existing detached garage and converted barn; Installation of 6no. rooflights in the front and rear roof slopes of the converted barn and 3no. rooflights in the rear roof slope of the existing detached garage; Changes to the external facing materials of the existing detached garage; Installation of 1no, 4-paned bi-fold door in side elevation of existing detached garage; Installation of 1no., 4-paned window in the rear elevation of the dwellinghouse. and installation of replacement like-for-like windows and doors. FOR Mr & Mrs Foss

This application is being presented to Committee as the Parish Council supports the application and it is recommended for refusal.

KEY ISSUES

The Site and its Location

The application site relates to a detached barn conversion located on the north-east side of Birmingham Road, in Haseley. The dwellinghouse is sited within a group of 4 buildings, including the Falcon Inn PH, which are surrounded by fields and are washed over by Green Belt. Falcon Barn is located to the rear of the site but has its own separate access driveway to the north of the group.

Falcon Barn was granted planning permission for its conversion to a dwellinghouse under planning permission ref: W/96/0042. As is routinely the case for barn conversions, Permitted Development Rights were removed by condition for development which falls within Schedule 2, Parts 1 and 2 of the General Permitted Development Order. Such rights were removed in order that any further development could be controlled by the LPA in the interest of preserving the special character and appearance of the building and the rural character of the site.

Since its initial conversion in 1996, Falcon Barn has undergone significant alteration. A total of 9 windows, 1 door and 8 rooflights have been installed within the elevations and roof of the barn. In addition to this, an oak-framed

detached garage has been erected to the north of the barn under planning permission ref: W/13/0569.

DETAILS OF THE DEVELOPMENT

Planning permission is sought for the erection of a single storey side extension which would link the converted barn and the existing detached garage. The proposed extension will be constructed using oak frames with a timber weather board facade and plain clay roof tiles to match those on the existing barn. The applicant also seeks planning permission to change the external facing materials on the front elevation of the existing detached garage from timber garage doors to timber weather boards. The installation of a number of new and replacement windows, doors and rooflights within the existing roofs and elevations of the two buildings is also proposed.

PLANNING HISTORY

W/96/0042: Conversion of an agricultural building to a single dwelling - Granted 21st February 1996.

W/03/0768: Construction of a new vehicular access - Granted 20th June 2003

W/04/1773: Conversion of existing integral garage to kitchen/diner - Withdrawn 3rd November 2004

W/05/0973: Erection of 2 timber garden sheds and conversion of garage to kitchen/diner - Granted 10th August 2005

W/13/0330: Erection of single storey, timber framed garage building - Refused 15th April 2013

W/13/0569: Erection of single storey timber framed garage building - Granted 25th June 2013

RELEVANT POLICIES

- National Planning Policy Framework
- The Current Local Plan
- DS18 - Green Belt (Warwick District Local Plan 2011-2029)
- BE3 - Amenity (Warwick District Local Plan 2011-2029)
- BE1 - Layout and Design (Warwick District Local Plan 2011-2029)
- H14 - Extensions to Dwellings in the Open Countryside (Warwick District Local Plan 2011-2029)
- NE3 - Biodiversity (Warwick District Local Plan 2011-2029)
- NE2 - Protecting Designated Biodiversity and Geodiversity Assets (Warwick District Local Plan 2011-2029)
- BE4 - Converting Rural Buildings (Warwick District Local Plan 2011-2029)
- Guidance Documents
- Parking Standards (Supplementary Planning Document)
- Residential Design Guide (Supplementary Planning Document- May 2018)
- Agricultural Buildings and Conversion - Barns (Supplementary Planning Guidance)

SUMMARY OF REPRESENTATIONS

Beausale, Haseley, Honiley & Wroxall Parish Council - Support.

Cllr Sue Gallagher - Support.

WCC Ecological Services - Objection, works could potential impact on an existing roost. Advise an Initial Bat Survey should be requested prior to determination of the application.

ASSESSMENT

Whether the proposal is appropriate development in the Green Belt and, if not, whether there are any very special circumstances which outweigh the harm by reason of inappropriateness and any other harm identified.

The NPPF lists exceptions to inappropriate development in the Green Belt which includes the limited extension of buildings which are not disproportionate. Warwick District Local Plan Policy H14 indicates that an extension of more than 30% of the gross floor space of the original dwelling is likely to be considered disproportionate in the Green Belt.

Original Ground Floor = 93.6 sqm

Original First Floor = 93.6 sqm

Original Total = 187.2 sqm

Proposed Ground Floor (including existing garage) = 146.8 sqm

Proposed First Floor (garage) = 93.6 sqm

Proposed Total = 240.40 sqm

Total % increase = 28.42%

As indicated above, the proposed addition (including the existing garage) equates to a 28.42% increase in floor area over and above the floor area of the original barn conversion and it is therefore considered to be a proportionate extension and in accordance with Local Plan Policies DS18 and H14 (which states that extensions up to 30% are to be considered proportionate in the context of the Green Belt). The proposal is therefore appropriate development and considered acceptable.

Design and Impact upon the Character of the Barn Conversion

Policy H14 of the Local Plan states that "in the case of barn conversions in the open countryside, the Council is extremely unlikely to grant approval for any extensions". Such conversions are only usually permitted where they can be undertaken with minimum disruption to the integrity of the original building.

The Council has also adopted a Design Guidance for Agricultural Buildings and Conversion as Supplementary Planning Guidance which seeks to protect the character and integrity of barns. As per standard practice, permitted development rights were removed as part of the permission for the conversion of the barn in order that the LPA could retain control over future alterations and extensions to ensure only appropriate works were carried out.

Rural barns are characterised by their simple appearance and fenestration and the Council's Design Guidance is quite clear that barn conversions should remain as "barn-like" as possible, and domestic or residential features are inappropriate and harmful additions to barns and their settings, not in keeping with their character. The Guidance specifically states that "conversion work must be contained within the curtilage of the existing buildings: new extensions, glazed links or conservatories will not be permitted".

For ease of assessment the proposals will be addressed individually.

Single storey link extension and alterations to the elevations of the existing oak-framed garage:

The proposed single storey link extension is to be constructed with an oak frame and timber weather boards. The front elevation of the proposed extension is comprised of an open porch canopy which will protrude from the front elevation of the extension by 0.90m. The rear elevation of the proposed extension is comprised of a predominantly glazed gable end; a set of French doors and clear glazing panels are encased by the oak framework. The front elevation of the existing garage is proposed to be altered by replacing the existing timber garage doors (hung with a light grey metal hinges) with timber weatherboarding to give an increasingly blank frontage. In addition, a set of 4 painted timber bi-fold doors are proposed to be installed in the side elevation of the existing garage.

It is considered that the proposed link extension and alterations to the elevations of the existing garage are unacceptable in principle; the proposals are contrary to Policy H14 and the Council's adopted Guidance for Barn Conversions. The aforementioned policies and guidance state that extensions to barn conversions are unlikely to be supported. In instances where they could be considered acceptable, proposals should retain the integrity of the original building, and be in keeping with the traditional and rural character of the Green Belt. The predominantly glazed rear elevation, open porch canopy and symmetrical fenestration give the extension a modern and overtly domestic appearance, at odds with the traditional agricultural character of the converted barn. The proposed use of timber cladding and oak frame for the external facing materials are not sympathetic nor in keeping with the original red brick used in the barn's construction. It is considered that the design of the proposed extension does not attempt to incorporate any of the traditional features of the barn and therefore fails to appear as a characteristic addition; for example the height of the eaves and the roof pitches are not matched therefore making the

extension appear as an awkward addition. It is considered that the proposed installation of 3 rooflights in the rear roof slope, and 4 panelled bi-fold doors in the side elevation of the existing garage in a linear arrangement further contribute to the overall modern and domestic character. Linear and symmetrical fenestration is not a characteristic feature of barns - historically windows and openings are punched through the original walls of agricultural buildings in a sporadic and random arrangement. For the reasons discussed, the LPA consider the extension will appear incongruous and harm the integrity and rural character of Falcon Barn.

Replacement windows and doors, additional 6no. rooflights and 1no. window in rear elevation of the barn:

Falcon Barn benefits from a number of alterations which have significantly impacted on the external appearance of the barn since its conversion. Although the dwelling has never been extended, numerous applications for additional windows and doors have been approved and implemented since its conversion. In their abundance, the existing modern and domestic additions draw away from the original agricultural character of Falcon Barn.

It is important to highlight at this stage that 4 rooflights have been installed within the front and rear roof slopes of Falcon Barn. This is an ongoing Enforcement case as planning permission has not been granted for these. As the 4 rooflights have been included in the proposed plans, they are included in the assessment of this planning application alongside the additional 2 rooflights proposed to be installed in the rear roof slope of the barn.

To summarise, the applicant seeks permission to install 6 rooflights in the front and rear roof slope of the barn dwelling (4 of which have already been installed). In addition, a single 4 paned window is proposed to be installed in the rear elevation of the barn, as well as the replacement of old doors and windows with like-for like replacements, using stained timber throughout.

It is considered that the proposed 6 rooflights and 4-paned window are unacceptable in principle. An abundance of existing alterations have already significantly changed the character of the barn, which would further be exacerbated by additional domestic and modern additions. Local Plan Policies DS18 and H14, and the Council's adopted Guidance for Barn Conversions state that proposals which fail to preserve or enhance the original agricultural and rural character of converted barns should not be supported. The guidance states that windows and doors should neither be of a contemporary style, nor in symmetrical rows as this is highly visually damaging. The guidance draws particular attention to patio doors or 'French' windows as they deemed totally inappropriate for agricultural barns - 2 are proposed to be replaced in addition to a further 2 installed within the elevations of the proposed link extension and existing garage.

Overall the proposed replacement fenestration and additional windows are considered to be harmful to the character and integrity of the barn conversion and are contrary to the aforementioned policies.

Impact on adjacent properties

Policy BE3 of the Warwick District Local Plan states that new development will not be permitted that has an unacceptable adverse impact on the amenity of nearby uses and residents.

As Falcon Barn is a considerable distance from any neighbours, is it considered that the proposed alterations and extension will not have an impact on the amenity of the nearby dwellings and business.

Based on this it is considered that the proposal is in accordance with Local Plan Policy BE3.

Access and Parking

Policy TR3 requires all development proposals to make adequate provision for parking for all users of a site in accordance with the relevant parking standards.

The proposed extension will enable an additional bedroom to be provided within the dwellinghouse, taking the total number of bedrooms in Falcon Barn from 3 to 4. As Falcon Barn benefits from an extensive driveway and parking area to the north-west of the dwellinghouse, it is considered that the proposals will not result in additional on-street parking.

The proposal is therefore in accordance with Local Plan Policy TR3 and the Parking Standards SPD.

Ecology

The County Ecologist has recommended that a preliminary bat survey is completed prior to the determination of the application due to the rural nature of the site which provides a good area for foraging and commuting bats. The Ecologist has also identified the building to have potential to support a bat roost. As the proposals are unacceptable in principle, Officers did not consider it necessary or appropriate to request a bat survey to be carried out prior to determination of the application due to the significant costs incurred by the applicant. Should the application be approved by the committee, it is considered that it would be appropriate and justified to request a bat survey be completed as a pre-commencement condition to ensure that protected species are adequately protected by the proposed development and mitigation measures are put in place to reduce the over impacts.

Summary/Conclusion

The proposal is not considered to meet the requirements of Local Plan Policies DS18 and H14, and the Guidance for Barn Conversions SPG and is therefore recommended for refusal.

REFUSAL REASONS

- 1 Policy H14 of the Warwick District Local Plan (2011-2029) sets out a number of criteria for the conversion of existing rural buildings within the District and the policy specifically refers to the need for the proposed use to be accommodated without extensive rebuilding or alteration to the external appearance of the building, and for the appearance and setting of the building following conversion to protect and where possible, enhance the character and appearance of the countryside. The explanation to the policy states that where proposals include extending rural buildings as part of their conversion, these will not be approved unless it can be demonstrated that the extension is essential for the retention of the building.

The application site which lies within the Green Belt, comprises a converted former agricultural building which is now used for residential occupation. The District Council has approved Supplementary Planning Guidance on barn conversions, and permitted development rights for subsequent extensions are removed in order to ensure that the character and appearance of the converted buildings and their setting within the wider countryside are respected and protected.

The proposed extension, additional windows and rooflights, replacement windows and doors are considered inappropriate alterations to this converted barn. In the opinion of the Local Planning Authority, the proposal disrupts the simple form of the converted barn in terms of the simple linear shape and also seeks to add a domestic feature both of which would detract from the original character and appearance of the building, thereby prejudicing the objectives of the aforementioned policy. If permitted, this type of extension could act as a precedent for extensions to other converted barns which would be difficult to resist, thereby cumulatively eroding the character and appearance of the countryside to the detriment of the wider Green Belt and open countryside within the District.

- 2 Paragraph 99 of Circular 06/2005 *Biodiversity and Geological Conservation – Statutory Obligations and their impact within the Planning System* advises that it is essential that the presence or otherwise of protected species, and the extent to which they might be affected by the proposed development, is established *before* planning permission is granted, otherwise all relevant material considerations will not have been addressed on making the decision. Circular 06/2005 advises that the need to ensure that ecological surveys are carried out should only be left to conditions in exceptional circumstances. No such circumstances exist in this case.