Planning Committee: 21 September 2005 Item Number: 05

Application No: W 05 / 1061 LB

Registration Date: 27/06/05

Town/Parish Council: Whitnash Expiry Date: 22/08/05

Case Officer: John Beaumont

01926 456533 planning_east@warwickdc.gov.uk

79-81 Whitnash Road, Whitnash, Leamington Spa, CV31 2HBConversion of 79/81 into 1 cottage with extension FOR Mr Graham

_ ------

This application was reported to Planning Committee in association with the planning application W051057 also on this agenda, to the meeting on 23rd August 2005. Determination was deferred to enable a site visit to be undertaken. The report which follows is that presented to the Planning Committee on 23rd August 2005 updated to include additional correspondence contained in the addendum to that meeting.

SUMMARY OF REPRESENTATIONS

Town Council: No objection.

Neighbours: No neighbour has objected to the proposed alterations to the "listed" building.

CAAF: It was felt that the new building was still not a suitable building and was uninspiring in this location, although it was accepted that the site could take a building which would close off the corner of the Conservation Area which currently leaks out into uninteresting modern buildings. It was also felt that the extension to the house is still rather large and would probably benefit from the kitchen being incorporated into the existing dwelling thus allowing the garage to be a detached building. Generally, it was felt a single garage would be better than a double garage.

English Heritage: In response to application W050564LB for a similar application on this site the English Heritage Historic Areas Adviser after visiting the site commented as follows:-

"To take the extension to the timber-frame cottage first I considered that an extension would be acceptable in principle and that forming a low linking building to make the junction with original cottage was an appropriate way to resolve the link. There is no doubt that reducing the height of the breakfast/kitchen element, as shown on the sketch faxed to me this afternoon, would make the extension less prominent in relation to the original building and provide a more satisfactory relationship between old and new fabric.

As to the free-standing new build, again I considered that in principle a building in this position would be acceptable. There would be space for it without dominating the timber-frame cottage and this part of the site is visually

degraded at present. I also noted that modern housing adjoining the site is visually prominent at present. I wonder whether the building as proposed tries a little too hard to look like a farm building which may not be appropriate in this location. In any case I would again support the amendments shown on the faxed sketch which would go further to achieving a hierarchy of buildings on the site in terms of volume and bulk in which the timber-frame house is dominant.

Thank you for seeking our advice. I hope that these comments are helpful."

In response to these comments, the applicant withdrew their application W050564LB and submitted the present, amended scheme, application W051061LB reflecting the amendments shown on the sketch referred to by English Heritage. A response to this application was received from English Heritage which stated:-

Summary

The proposals are to construct a new house in the grounds of the grade II listed building and to extend the listed building with a large garage. Neither the proposed new house nor the large extension do anything to improve the setting of the listed building, nor do they offer any benefits.

English Heritage Advice

The scheme involves the extension of the main listed building, whilst converting if from two houses into one. In principle the latter is welcome, but the proposed extension is over scale in the context of the modest listed building.

The proposed construction of a new house in such close proximity to the existing building is highly undesirable in terms of its impact upon the setting of the listed house.

Recommendations

A more modest scheme for the main house could be considered. Anything beyond a small detached garage in the grounds would seem to be overdoing the amount of development which the setting of the listed building could absorb.

Next Steps

We consider that the implications of this application are so significant that we would welcome the opportunity of advising further on the revised proposals. Please let me have the necessary additional information in time for use to comment again if necessary before the application is determined."

I wrote to English Heritage to request an explanation for the conflicting advice offered on the proposals, the subject of this application and they responded

withdrawing their later comments and confirming their initial comments (made after a site visit) were the ones which should be taken into account.

RELEVANT POLICIES

(DW) ENV11 - Retention of Listed Buildings (Warwick District Local Plan 1995)

DAP6 - Protection of Listed Buildings (Warwick District 1996 - 2011 First Deposit Version)

PPG15: Planning and the Historic Environment).

PLANNING HISTORY

A listed building application for similar extensions and for the conversion of 79/81 into one cottage was withdrawn in June 2005, reference W05/0564LB.

KEY ISSUES

The Site and its Location

The site comprises a pair of semi-detached timber framed, thatched cottages in the Conservation Area. The site is accessed via "The Doglands", a single track road off Whitnash Road. The cottages have a large fore garden which presently contains a single pre-fabricated concrete garage. The site is adjoined by other properties fronting The Doglands and the rear gardens of other properties fronting Masters Road and Palmer Road.

Details of the Development

The proposal entails:-

- The conversion of the existing two cottages into a single dwelling; this
 entails the formation of doorway openings at ground and first floor to link
 the existing accommodation;
- The erection of a single storey extension to the existing cottages to provide a breakfast/kitchen, utility room and double garage. This extension would be linked to the existing cottages by an entrance lobby.

Assessment

This application is a revised submission following the withdrawal of an earlier application for development on this site. The scheme was revised to take into account the observations of English Heritage. I consider that the scheme now presented will not harm the fabric of the existing listed building and would represent a sensitive and well mannered extension to this building.

I note English Heritage have now confirmed they raise no objection to the proposals and hence subject to a careful choice of materials and detailing, I consider that consent should now be granted.

REASON FOR RECOMMENDATION

The proposal is considered to comply with the policies listed above.

RECOMMENDATION

GRANT subject to the following conditions:

- The works hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of five years from the date of this consent. **REASON**: To comply with Section 18 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.
- The development hereby permitted shall be carried out strictly in accordance with the details shown on the approved drawing no 04.311.2A ,deposited with the District Planning Authority on 27th June 2005 unless first agreed otherwise in writing by the District Planning Authority.

 REASON: For the avoidance of doubt and to secure a satisfactory form of development in accordance with Local Plan Policy ENV3.
- No development shall be carried out on the site which is the subject of this permission, until large scale details of doors, windows (including a section showing the window reveal, heads and cill details), eaves, verges and rainwater goods at a scale of 1:5 have been submitted to and approved by the District Planning Authority. The development shall not be carried out otherwise than in full accordance with such approved details. **REASON**: To ensure a high standard of design and appearance for this Listed Building, and to satisfy Policy ENV11 of the Warwick District Local Plan 1995.
- Samples of all external facing materials to be used for the construction of the development hereby permitted, shall be submitted to and approved by the District Planning Authority before any constructional works are commenced. Development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details. REASON: To ensure that the visual amenities of the area are protected, and to satisfy the requirements of Policy ENV3 of the Warwick District Local Plan.
- All rainwater goods for the development hereby permitted shall be metal and no development on site shall take place until a sample of the rainwater goods has been submitted to and approved by the District Planning Authority. **REASON**: To ensure a high standard of design and appearance for this Listed Building, and to satisfy Policy ENV11 of the Warwick District Local Plan 1995.
